

Analysis of Shopping Mall Attractiveness and Customer Loyalty

Godwin Uche Aliagha^{a*}, Yeoh Guan Qin^a, Kherun Nita Ali^b, Mat Naim Abdullah^a

^aDepartment of Real Estate, Faculty of Geoinformation and Real Estate, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, 81310 UTM Johor Bahru, Johor, Malaysia

^bDepartment of Quantity Surveying, Faculty of Built Environment Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, 81310 UTM Johor Bahru, Johor, Malaysia

*Corresponding author: galiagha@utm.my

Article history

Received :1 November 2014

Received in revised form :

31 March 2015

Accepted :30 April 2015

Abstract

In a highly competitive retail market like Malaysia, shopping mall facilities and management services that are not customer oriented may drop out of competition and business. This is contingent upon the fact that growing competition among shopping malls in Malaysia in response to rising affluence and purchasing power has raised the challenge of customer loyalty as customers find it easier to defect to other shopping malls. Based on a survey of 250 customers and multiple regression method, three models were developed to assess the strength of the relationship between customer loyalty and shopping mall attractiveness. The models are (I) repeat shopping oriented customer loyalty model; (II) bring friends for shopping oriented customer loyalty model; (III) get rewards and free gift oriented customer loyalty model. In terms of predictive power, model II which accounted for 71% of variance in customer loyalty was found to be the best followed by model I which accounted for 59% of variance in customer loyalty. The third model though significant accounted for only 29 % and hence, did not yield much result in predicting customer loyalty.

Keywords: Customer loyalty; shopping mall attractiveness; customer satisfaction; multiple regression models; retailing in Malaysia

Abstrak

Dalam pasaran peruncitan yang kompetitif seperti di Malaysia, kemudahan pusat beli-belah dan perkhidmatan pengurusan yang tidak berorientasikan pelanggan boleh ketinggalan daripada persaingan dan perniagaan. Ini adalah bergantung hakikat bahawa persaingan semakin meningkat di kalangan pusat membeli-belah di Malaysia sebagai tindak balas kepada peningkatan kemewahan dan kuasa membeli yang telah mencabar kesetiaan pelanggan kerana pelanggan lebih mudah untuk memilih pusat membeli-belah yang lain. Berdasarkan kajian 250 orang pelanggan dan kaedah regresi berganda, tiga model telah dibangunkan untuk menilai kekuatan hubungan antara kesetiaan pelanggan dan daya tarikan pusat membeli-belah. Model-modelnya adalah (I) model kesetiaan pelanggan yang berorientasikan membeli-belah secara berulang; (II) model kesetiaan pelanggan yang berorientasikan membawa rakan-rakan untuk membeli-belah; (III) model kesetiaan pelanggan yang berorientasikan ganjaran dan hadiah percuma. Dari segi kuasa ramalan, model II yang menyumbang sebanyak 71% daripada varians dalam kesetiaan pelanggan adalah yang terbaik diikuti oleh model I yang menyumbang 59% daripada varians dalam kesetiaan pelanggan. Model ketiga walaupun agak penting hanya menyumbang sebanyak 29% dan dengan itu, tidak menghasilkan keputusan yang lebih dalam meramalkan kesetiaan pelanggan.

Kata kunci: Kesetiaan pelanggan; tarikan pusat beli-belah; kepuasan pelanggan; model regresi berganda; peruncitan di Malaysia

© 2015 Penerbit UTM Press. All rights reserved.

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The rapid economic growth, high urbanization rate coupled with rising income and globalisation has created a boom market for the development of quality, world-class malls in Malaysia. The rapid increase in number of shopping malls across Malaysia has led to the prediction of looming oversupply [1]. Table 1 shows that between 2007 and 2010 about 379 hypermarket outlets opened in

Malaysia and the forecast is that by 2014 the number will reach 889 [2]. In Sungai Petani where this study was based there were more than 10 Shopping malls such as, Central Square, Village Mall, Lagenda Height, Tesco, Giant, Econsave, Billion, Sp Plaza, Parkson, Gmart, and Jusco (under construction). The malls have created a new lifestyle and a change in consumer behaviour and Malaysians have become more demanding in their shopping expectations. Unlike in the past, the subject of shopping mall today

has become increasingly complex in terms of size, type and characteristics [3]. Shopping centres have gone beyond their initial role as centre of purchasing goods to becoming centre for social

and recreation activity. Owing to the changing consumer needs shopping malls have grown larger and their one- stop convenience has expanded to include service outlets and entertainment centres.

Table 1 Malaysia hypermarket sales and forecast

Year	Value sales RM million	Outlets	Selling space '000 sq m
2007	6,880.8	78.0	639.9
2008	8566.5	97.0	793.5
2009	10065.7	107.0	841.1
2010	10820.6	115.0	887.4
2011	11415.7	121.0	927.3
2012	11929.5	126.0	964.4
2013	12347.0	130.0	993.3
2014	12655.7	133.0	1,013.2

Source: Euromonitor International [2]

The situation today is such that malls are becoming important entertainment centres while their traditional retail occupants are now seen as secondary [4]. As [5], pointed out, it may be difficult for one to discern nowadays when inside a mall or a theme park due to the creative and interesting image malls present. In Malaysia, the situation is such that shopping malls have surpassed their initial roles as centres of economic activity to becoming a meeting point for the young and the old for social and recreational activities.

The implication of competition and increasing number of shopping malls in Malaysia is that customers find it easier with least cost to defect or switch to other malls particularly now most of the shopping centres are offering identical goods and services. With increasing defection and switching, shopping mall operators are re-examining and re-strategizing the means to enhance customer loyalty and retain customers. Customer loyalty pundits argue that it is more cost effective to retain customers than to acquire them. This is because customer loyalty generates a stable pool of customers for a firm's product or service as loyal customers tend to buy more, are willing to pay higher prices and have good opinion about the firm [6]. Most researches on consumer behaviour and customer retention seems to focus on customer satisfaction [7, 8, 9, 10, and 11]. Though customer satisfaction and customer loyalty are closely related, there are fundamental differences between the two. As satisfaction is about specific need of a rational mind being met, customer satisfaction is pleasant assessment of a specific business transaction. Loyalty is about an emotional connection between a customer and a company. Although customer satisfaction is often a precursor to customer loyalty, customer loyalty engenders longer term customer retention. A loyal customer proactively promotes company, tells his or her friends and perhaps, more importantly forgives minor mistakes on inconveniences if they are attended appropriately, may not even look at competitive offerings [12].

This study examines the nature and strength of relationship between shopping mall attractiveness and customer loyalty in Sungai Petani, Kedah, Malaysia. Put differently, based on the attributes of shopping mall attractiveness, the research seeks to identify models that best explains customer loyalty.

2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Elements of Shopping Mall Attractiveness

It was argued that that location is the most important element in determining the success of any particular shopping complex and a well located and well managed mall will continue to weather

the business storm [13, 14]. This is because of the believe that location has great influence on customer decisions when choosing shopping malls to patronize. Akin to location is accessibility and is a critical factor that also determines the success or failure of a shopping centre and this is often measured by the ease with which customers and other users move in and out of the shopping centre [15]. Customers always consider the element of accessibility high in their shopping decisions. According to [16], accessibility or linkage is the costs of overcoming friction in the real estate market. It offers customers the convenience of overcoming the barrier of distance in terms of time and space. An efficient public transport system with a good inter-modal link helps in movement of people and goods. Location of a shopping mall near public bus and taxi terminals will encourage the inflow of customers.

Contemporary shopping centres are epitome of architectural master piece and designs that are often reflected in their internal and exterior image [17]. Design features such as ceiling, lighting fittings, painting, other internal views and landscaping are given proper attention when designing and building any shopping complex. [18] in their study their effect of architectural design on customers patronising a shopping mall found that interior decoration had a strong positive effect on the customers' choice for shopping centre. Similarly, in a study on shopping habits of Malaysian students Ahmed [4] found that interior designs is one of the primary motivating factors in choosing malls.

The quality of facilities within a shopping mall will go a long way in influencing patronage and visit by potential customers. New generation shopping centres have such facilities as ATM, parking lot, sanitary facility, food court, and walkway for the physically challenged, bureau de change, Surau (praying room), public telephone booth and banks located in them. The availability of these facilities makes shopping convenient and easier for customers. According to Ismail [19], to make shopping mall more attractive, the management of shopping mall should provide comfort and convenience to consumers in terms of parking spaces, resting place, security and maintaining cleanliness in shopping mall. Davis [20] noted that parking space is especially a cause for concern in densely populated areas. Car park attractiveness of any shopping mall will depend on two conditions: parking capacity (the number of cars that can be parked), and parking configuration (the way the parking lot is laid out, the direction of the travel lanes and spaces, the presence of berms and landscaping).

The high rate of crime in most urban centres and the increasing threats of terrorism around the world has made security a major issue in shopping mall management and design [21]. In a state of insecurity, customers may not comfortable

visiting the shopping centre. Shoppers always prefer shopping malls that provide good security system via the use of close circuit television (CCTV) and security guards. Providing all these will help in making customers feel secured in the shopping centre.

Entertainment is increasingly an integral part of the shopping centre experience in our modern day life. Consumers are no longer looking for only shopping centres that offer shopping, but also places that entertain them, so developers are trying to create places that consumers enjoy, not just a place to buy things [22]. In their study on the impact of entertainment as motivation for shopping, in San Diego, Cleveland and Atlanta, [23], found that more female than male shoppers indicated a high level of entertainment as motivation for shopping. Also, those with low level of education tended to have a high level of entertainment as motivation for shopping and shoppers who perceived a high level of enjoyment according to this study usually spend more time on shopping than those that experienced a low level of enjoyment.

Having variety of choices in shopping mall attracts customers because they are given the opportunity to make comparison on goods and services offered [24] and variety of tenants give an exciting experience in a shopping Centre [25]. A shopping complex with variety of choices influence customer loyalty and where this is lacking, the customer may not be visiting the shopping centre frequently since all the items he/she needs are not found.

2.2 Customer Loyalty

Customer loyalty is considered as the basis of competitive advantage and has strong influence on company's performance [26]. According to [27] customer loyalty is the willingness of a customer to stay with the current service provider. Customer's point of view about value acknowledgement from service provider may motivate them to patronize the provider again [28]. Two factors, dealer and customer factor influence customer loyalty. The dealer factor comprises of choice, price, market environment and salesmen while the customer factor comprise of social contact, time, participation and financial resources [29]. [30] Noted that another factor - traffic is also important besides the retail and consumer factor. However, [31] observed that a positive link exist between service quality and customer behavioural intentions and that strong customer service leads to customer satisfaction which will invariably lead to loyal behaviour.

Loyalty will result in repeat purchase tendencies by the customer towards the business enterprise [32]. When true loyalty exists, customers will regularly conduct repeat purchase

transactions because of the strong preference they have for the business enterprise [33]. In their own view, [34] noted that while repeat visiting behaviour is important, attention should also be paid to the antecedents that may account for the occurrence of certain behaviour. Loyalty of a customer is not only based on quality, price, physical facilities or satisfaction but is based more on customer feelings and perceptions about the enterprise [35]. What this suggests therefore is that the provision of physical elements alone cannot bring about customers loyalty. Gifts and incentives have been found to be having an effect on customers' loyalty. In their study, [36] found that giving such incentives like free gifts, gift vouchers, coupons, free items and accumulation of reward points increased customers likelihood of engaging in word-of-mouth behaviour and that those who received benefits such as gifts were more loyal than those that were given a complimentary note [37].

The quality of service provided may well determine customer loyalty. Because given that service quality is a long-term overall qualitative appraisal or judgment on the excellence of service, customer loyalty could be a function of service quality. This is perhaps why [38] found that there is a relationship between repeat purchase and customer loyalty. [39] In a study on the impact of shopping experience in retaining customer loyalty in India found that shopping experience and customer loyalty are directly related and that if the shopping experience is pleasant, customer's loyalty towards retail store is high and vice versa. The author maintained that the various activities of retailer such as service quality, ambience and pricing strategies help to build customer loyalty. According to Bob Thompson (CEO, Customer Think Corporation) just as emotion plays a key role in customers' decision to stop patronizing a business, emotion can be used to keep customers from leaving if he is satisfied. Even the very basic act of re-communicating with these people, without any kind of formal program, gets you tremendous returns. In other words, people do want to be engaged, not only on a functional or rational level, but they want to know that you care, and they want to hear from you. This type of friendly relation with customers increases their level of loyalty.

3.0 METHODOLOGY

3.1 Instruments and Measures

Based on the literature review the six constructs and fifteen indicators of shopping mall attractiveness were identified while one construct and three indicators were identified for customer loyalty (see Table 2).

Table 2 Research constructs and indicators

Shopping Mall Attractiveness		
<i>Physical Elements</i>	<i>Quality of Building Facilities</i>	<i>Entertainment</i>
1. PE- Location	4. BF- Banks/ ATMs	7. E- Food court
2. PE- Cleanliness	5. BF- Washrooms	8. E- Gaming centre
3. PE- Architecture & design	6. BF- Car Park	9. E- Cinema
<i>Quality of service</i>	<i>Price and variety</i>	<i>Accessibility</i>
9. QS- Qualities of information from the customer service staff	11. PV- Variety of choices	13. A Access Roads
10. QS- Friendliness of the customer service staff	12. PV- Cheaper price	14. A- Access Bus and taxi station
Customer loyalty		
1. CL- Repeat shopping oriented customer loyalty		
2. CL- Bringing friends and relations oriented customer loyalty		
CL Get rewards and free gift oriented customer loyalty		

The primary data was based on questionnaire survey. The first part required the respondents to disclose their demographic information such as gender, race, age and income. Consistent with the objective of the study, the questions asked in the second part of the questionnaire were related to indicators of shopping mall attractiveness and customer loyalty shown in Table 2. The items were presented in 5-point likert scale (1 = strongly disagree, 5 strongly agree). The coefficients of the cronbach's Alpha reliability of the items ranged from .726 to 0.834.

3.2 Participants

The study was based on self-administered questionnaire and the participants were randomly selected from customers aged 18 years and above that come to shop at The Central Mall in Sungai Petani. Out of the 250 valid questionnaires received 35.60% were males ($N = 89$) and 64.40% were females ($N = 161$) (On race profile 52% participants were Malay ($N = 130$), Chinese 32% ($N = 80$), Indians 10% ($N = 25$) and others 6% ($N = 15$). The participants also reflected different age groups with age 18 – 25 constituting 34% ($N=85$); 26-35 years making up 31.20% ($N=78$); 36-50 years representing 28% ($N=70$) and above 50 years old making the remaining 6.8% ($N = 17$).

3.3 Analysis

The data was analysed using multiple regression method because the study involves multiple predictors of variance in dependent variables. To achieve the objectives of this study 3 dependent variables for customer loyalty (repeat shopping, bring friends and relations to shopping mall, and get rewards and free gifts) were regressed on 15 independent variables of shopping mall attractiveness. The multiple regressions thus provided a means to objectively assess the degree and the character of the relationship between customer loyalty and shopping mall attractiveness. The regression was performed using LISREL (linear structural relations) software. The equation for multiple regression analysis is expressed as:

$$Y = a + b_1X_1 + b_2X_2 + b_3X_3 + \dots + b_nX_n \quad \text{where}$$

Y	= dependent variable
a	= intercept
Bn	= regression coefficient for the independent variables
Xn	= independent variable

The interpretation the regression relied heavily on: (1) the R^2 for strength of relationship and variance in each of the dependent variables of customer loyalty accounted by the set of variable for shopping mall attractiveness; and (2) beta (β) values for assessing relative impact size of each of the independent variable on customer loyalty variables.

4.0 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The aim of this study is to analyse the relationship that exists between customer loyalty and shopping mall attractiveness. Customer loyalty in this study is measured by repeat shopping, bringing friends and relations to shopping mall and getting the store card rewards. Hence, a regression analysis was performed to test three models on customer loyalty using LISREL.

Model 1

In the first model, repeat shopping oriented customer loyalty was regressed against 15 independent variables (location, architecture, cleanliness, ATM/banks, washroom, car park, food court, gaming, cinema, road network, bus/taxi stations, quality of information, friendliness of staff, variety of items and cheaper price). All the variables in the multiple regression analysis were entered at once. Results (Table 3) revealed that there was a strong significant relationship between repeat shopping oriented customer loyalty and the shopping mall attractiveness ($R^2 = 0.585$). This suggests that the model explained (58.5% variance in repeat shopping oriented customer loyalty. The model could be adjudged a good one. However error variance of 41.5 is also significant, implying that there were 41.5 % unaccounted variance or other factors that could influence repeat shopping oriented customer oriented loyalty the model did not account for or capture.

The contribution of each independent variable when others are held constant in the model was further examined. The standardized beta coefficient value (regression weight) in the model results (Table 3) reveals the contribution of each variable. Results showed that a significant relationship exists between repeat shopping oriented customer loyalty and washroom ($\beta = 0.536$), cleanliness ($\beta = 0.402$), bus/taxi station ($\beta = 0.301$) Car park ($\beta = 0.267$), food court ($\beta = 0.260$), ATM/banks ($\beta = 0.194$), location ($\beta = 0.247$), games ($\beta = 0.244$), quality of information ($\beta = 0.256$), friendliness of staff ($\beta = 0.179$), variety of choices ($\beta = 0.333$) and cheaper price ($\beta = 0.290$).

On the contrary, architecture and cinema were not significant, what this means in essence, is that their contribution to the model was very little. The reason for this is not farfetched; the central mall was built many years ago, so customers may not really be bothered about its architectural design. Of the 15 independent variables that were regressed against repeat shopping in the first model, four variables: washroom ($\beta = 0.536$), cleanliness ($\beta = 0.402$), variety of choices ($\beta = 0.333$), bus/taxi stations (0.301) were distinct in their contribution to this model. As could be seen from the results, when other covariates are held constant, washroom ($\beta = 0.536$) had the largest overall effect on repeat shopping. This means that an additional unit in washroom would bring about 0.536 or 54 % variation on repeat shopping in the mall by customers. In a similar vein, a unit increase in the level of cleanliness in the shopping mall will result to 0.402 or 40.2 % variations on repeat shopping by potential customers while adding one unit to the variety of items in the shopping mall brings about 0.333 or 33.3% variations on repeat shopping by customers. The contribution of these four variables in the model reveal two things, first, that shoppers placed great premium on the hygienic condition (physical element and building facilities) of the shopping mall they patronize. Secondly, accessibility of a shopping complex in terms of location of bus/taxi stations near the shopping centre has a strong effect on customer loyalty.

Table 3 Repeat shopping oriented customer loyalty vs shopping mall attractiveness

CL_REPET =	B 0.247*PE_LOCTN	+β0.0503*PE_ARCH	+β 0.402*PE_CLEAN	
Stand Error	(0.0574)	(0.0518)	(0.0507)	
t-values	4.301	0.970	7.924	
P-values	0.000	0.332	0.000	
	+β 0.194*BF_ATMBK	+β 0.536*BF_WASHR	+β 0.267*BF_CARPK	
	(0.0531)	(0.0588)	(0.0580)	
	3.662	9.111	4.606	
	0.000	0.000	0.000	
	+β 0.260*E_FOADC	+β 0.224*E_GAMING	+β 0.0541*E_CENIMA	
	(0.0498)	(0.0513)	(0.0531)	
	5.226	4.359	1.017	
	0.000	0.000	0.309	
	+β 0.109*AC_ROAD	+β 0.301*AC_BUSTX	+β 0.256*QS_QINFO	
	(0.0502)	(0.0474)	(0.0552)	
	2.174	6.344	4.641	
	0.030	0.000	0.000	
	+β 0.179*QS_FREND	+β 0.333*PV_VARTY	+β 0.290*PV_CHEAP	R² = 0.585
	(0.0527)	(0.0567)	(0.0528)	Error Var
	3.397	5.866	5.494	= 0.415
	0.001	0.000	0.000	

Table 4 Bring friends for shopping oriented customer loyalty vs shopping mall attractiveness

CL_BFREN =	β 0.0350*PE_LOCTN	+B0.364*PE_ARCH	+β 0.392*PE_CLEAN	
Stand Error	(0.0427)	(0.0410)	(0.0407)	
t-values	0.820	8.863	9.630	
P-values	0.412	0.000	0.000	
	+β0.549*BF_ATMBK	+B0.523*BF_WASHR	+β 0.0166*BF_CARPK	
	(0.0429)	(0.0476)	(0.0449)	
	12.783	10.980	0.370	
	0.000	0.000	0.712	
	β +0.151*AC_ROAD	+β 0.251*AC_BUSTX	+β 0.224*QS_QINFO	
	(0.0414)	(0.0376)	(0.0420)	
	3.663	6.674	5.345	
	0.000	0.000	0.000	
	+B0.00768*QS_FREND	+β 0.370*PV_VARTY	+β 0.221*PV_CHEAP	R² = 0.711
	(0.0421)	(0.0464)	(0.0394)	Error Var
	0.183	7.988	5.610	= 0.289
	0.855	0.000	0.000	

Model 11

The second model tests whether any relationship exists between bringing friends for shopping oriented customer loyalty and shopping mall attractiveness. Twelve independent variables were regressed against customer loyalty (bringing friends for shopping). Results (Table 4) revealed that there was a significant relationship between bringing friends for shopping oriented customer loyalty and shopping mall attractiveness ($R^2 = 0.71$, $P < 0.05$). This is a very good model because it accounted for 71.1% of variance in bring friends for shopping oriented customer loyalty. With an error variance of 28.9 %, which could be attributed to other unaccounted factors which were not incorporated into the study; it is obvious from this result that the model predicted bringing friends oriented customer loyalty to a very large extent. Looking at the contribution of the variables in the model, it could be seen that significant relationship exists between architecture & design ($\beta = 0.364$, $P < 0.05$), cleanliness

($\beta = 0.392$, $P < 0.05$), ATM/banks ($\beta = 0.549$, $P < 0.05$), washroom ($\beta = 0.523$, $P < 0.05$), access road ($\beta = 0.151$, $P < 0.05$), access bus/taxi station ($\beta = 0.251$, $P < 0.05$), quality of information ($\beta = 0.224$, $P < 0.05$), variety of choices ($\beta = 0.370$, $P < 0.05$), cheaper prices ($\beta = 0.221$, $P < 0.05$) and customer loyalty.

In contrast, location ($\beta = 0.0350$, $P > 0.05$), car park (0.0166, $P > 0.05$) and friendliness of staff ($\beta = 0.00768$) were not significant in this model. For the variables that showed significant relationship with customer loyalty in this model, their individual contributions were examined. ATM/banks ($\beta = 0.549$) contributed most followed by wash room ($\beta = 0.523$), cleanliness ($\beta = 0.392$), architectural design ($\beta = 0.364$). What this means in essence, is that a unit increase in ATM/banks within the shopping mall holding other independent variables constant will bring about 0.549 or 54.9% variation in bringing friends for shopping oriented customer loyalty. Similarly, one unit increase in washroom when other independent variables are held constant brings about 0.523 or 52.3% variation in bringing friends for

shopping oriented customer loyalty, while a unit increase in the level of cleanliness in the shopping mall brings about 0.392 or 39.2% variation in bringing friends for shopping oriented customer loyalty. The findings are in agreement with [38] who found that ambience and pricing strategy are directly related to customer loyalty. One salient point from the two models is the significant impact quality of building facilities (washroom) and physical element (cleanliness) has on customer loyalty.

Model 111

The third model looks at the relationship that exists between get rewards and free gift oriented customer loyalty and shopping mall attractiveness. Twelve independent variables were regressed against reward in this model. The model result (Table 5) showed

that a significant but weak relationship exist between get rewards and free gift oriented customer loyalty and shopping mall attributes ($R^2 = 0.288$, $P < 0.05$). This model explained only 28.8% of customer loyalty with respect to rewards. However, the model could not account for 71.2 % of variance. With this large percentage of unaccounted variance in the model, its predicting power may not be strong enough. From the breakdown of the results in Table 3, only 3 variables in the model were significant: quality of building facilities (car park $\beta = 0.352$, $P < 0.05$), accessibility (bus/taxi station $\beta = 0.168$, $P < 0.05$, road $\beta = 0.368$, $P < 0.05$). The rest, (location $\beta = 0.101$, architectural design $\beta = 0.00362$, cleanliness, $\beta = 0.0199$, ATM/bank B $\beta = 0.0785$, washroom $\beta = 0.119$, quality of information $\beta = 0.112$, friendliness $\beta = 0.0622$, variety of choices $\beta = 0.00928$, cheaper prices $\beta = 0.0310$ $P > 0.05$) had very little contribution in the model.

Table 5 Get rewards and free gifts oriented customer loyalty vs shopping mall attractiveness

CL_REWAD =	β 0.101*PE_LOCTN	$+\beta$ 0.00362*PE_ARCH	$+\beta$ 0.0199*PE_CLEAN	
Stand Error	(0.0670)	(0.0644)	(0.0639)	
t-values	1.504	0.0562	0.311	
P-values	0.133	0.955	0.756	
	$+\beta$ 0.0785*BF_ATMBK	$+\beta$ 0.119*BF_WASHR	$+\beta$ 0.352*BF_CARPK	
	(0.0674)	(0.0747)	(0.0704)	
	1.165	1.590	5.004	
	0.244	0.112	0.000	
	$+\beta$ 0.368*AC_ROAD	$+\beta$ 0.168*AC_BUSTX	$+\beta$ 0.112*QS_QINFO	
	(0.0649)	(0.0589)	(0.0658)	
	5.67	2.847	1.706	
	0.000	0.004	0.088	
	$+\beta$ 0.0622*QS_FREND	$+\beta$ 0.00928*PV_VARTY	$+\beta$ 0.0310*PV_CHEAP	R² = 0.288
	(0.0660)	(0.0727)	(0.0618)	Error Var
	0.943	0.128	0.502	= 0.712
	0.346	0.899	0.616	

5.0 CONCLUSION

Long term customer retention through loyalty influencers is essential for competitive advantage in retail industry. The three models used in this study for assessing the relationship that exists between customer loyalty and shopping mall attractiveness have helped in revealing the strength of the various shopping mall attributes on customer loyalty. A look at the three models showed that some variables were prominent in terms of their contribution in the model fit. For instance, cleanliness of the shopping mall, wash room, bus/ taxi stations, car park, food court, variety of choices contributed greatly in models 1 and 11 while road contributed significantly in model 111. In terms of model fit and predicting power, model 11 which accounted for 71.1% of variance in bringing friends for shopping oriented customer loyalty is the best followed by the first model which accounted for 58.5% of variance in repeat shopping oriented customer loyalty. The third model which could account for only 28.8 % may not yield much result in terms of prediction of rewards and free gift oriented customer loyalty. As seen from these results, the shopping mall attractiveness in terms of the physical element (cleanliness), quality of building facilities (ATMs/banks, washroom, car park) and accessibility (roads, bus/taxi stations) contributed significantly in explaining customer loyalty in this study.

References

- [1] Wong, J. 2012. *Property Country Report: Malaysia*. Asia Pacific Cutons, Phnom Phenh. March, 15.
- [2] Euromonitor International. 2010. *Retail Trade International*. 17th ed. London, Uk.
- [3] Pitt, M. and Zairul, N. M. 2009. Towards Defining Shopping Centres and Their Management System. *Journal of Retail and Leisure Property*. 8(1): 39–55.
- [4] Ahmed, Z. U, Ghingold M, and Zainurin D. 2007. Malaysian Shopping Mall Behavior: An Exploratory Study. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing*. 19(4): 331–348.
- [5] Underhill, P. 1999. *Why we Buy? The Science of Shopping*. New York: Simon Schuster.
- [6] Wallacea, D. W., Giese, J. L., and Johnson, J. L. 2004. Customer Retailer Loyalty in the Context of Multiple Channel Strategies. *Journal of Retailing*. 80: 249–263.
- [7] Cronin, J. J., Brady, M. K., and Hult, G. T. M. 2000. Assessing the Effects of Quality, Value, and Customer Satisfaction on Consumer Behavioural Intentions in Service Environments'. *Journal of Retailing*. 2(76): 193–218.
- [8] Kotler, O. A. G and Cunningham, P. G. 2002. *Principles of Marketing*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- [9] Yiu, C.Y. and Yau, Y. 2006. An Ecological Framework for the Strategic Positioning of a Shopping mall. *Journal of Retail and Leisure Property*. 4(5): 270–280.
- [10] Khairul, A. M. A and Juliana, O. 2010. Shopping Mall Attractiveness: Study on Factors that Influenced Decision-Making in Choosing a Shopping Mall. *Journal of Quality Measurement and Analysis*. 6(1): 65–73.
- [11] Wong, C. B., Cheong, H. N and Wong, K. K. 2012. The Relationship between Shopping Mall Attributes, Customer Satisfaction and Positive

- Word-Of-Mouth: China Visitors in Hong Kong; Global. *Journal of Management and Business Research*. 3(12): 49–61.
- [12] Doren, D. V. 2006. IP and Customer Loyalty. *VON Magazine June Issue*. P 1–4.
- [13] Golden, G. L. and Zimmerman, A. D. 1986. *Effective Retailing*. 2nd Edition. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- [14] Ibrahim, M. F. and Wee. 2002. Determinants of Entertaining Shopping Experiences and their Link to Consumer Behaviour: Case Studies of Shopping Centres in Singapore. *J. Retail. Leisure Property*. 2(4): 338–357.
- [15] Levy, M., and Weitz, B. 1998. *Retailing Management*. 3rd edn. United States: McGraw-Hill.
- [16] Boyce, M. S. 1984. Restitution of R- and K-Selection as a Model of Density-Dependent Natural Selection. *Ann. Rev. Ecol. System*. 15: 427–47.
- [17] Loudon, D. L. and Bitta, A. J. D. 2003. *Consumer Behaviour, Concepts and Applications*. 4th ed. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.
- [18] Wakefield, K. L. and Baker, J. 1998. Excitement at the Mall: Determinants and Effects on Shopping Response. *Journal of Retailing*. 4(74): 515–539.
- [19] Ismail, El-Adly M. 2006. Shopping Malls Attractiveness: A Segmentation Approach. *International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management*. 35(11):939–950.
- [20] Davis, P. C. 2001. Site and Location Characteristics Can Greatly Influence Customer Loyalty to a co-op and the co-op's Competitiveness. <http://www.cooperativegrocer.coop/articles/2004-01-08/location-location-locationand-site-site-siteco-ops-are-retailers-too> Accessed on May 2013.
- [21] Coleman P, 2006. *Shopping Environments: Evolution, Planning and Design*. Oxford: Architectural Press.
- [22] White R, 2008. The Role of Entertainment in Shopping Centers & Malls. White Hutchinson Leisure & Learning Group's Leisure eNewsletter. 5 (8).
- [23] Kang, Jikyeong and Youn-Kyung Kim. 1999. Role of Entertainment in Cross-Shopping in the Revitalization of Regional Shopping Centers. *Journal of Shopping Center Research*. 6(2): 41–71.
- [24] Raines, K. 2005. *The Leaky Bucket: A Picture of Customer Retention in the UK Performing Arts*. Uk: DixonRaines Ltd.
- [25] Cockerham P.W. 1995. Homart Revives Virginia Mall With Renovation and Remarketing. *Stores*. 16 –18.
- [26] Rust, R.T., Zeithaml, V. A. and Lemon, K. N. 2000. *Driving Customer Equity*. New York, NY: Free Press.
- [27] Zeithaml, V. A., Berry, L. L. and Parasuraman, A. 1996. The Behavioural Consequences of Service Quality. *Journal of Marketing Management*. 60(No. April): 31–46.
- [28] Ishag, I. 2012. Perceived Value, Service Quality, Corporate Image and Customer Loyalty: Empirical Assessment from Pakistan. *Serbian Journal of Management*. 7(1): 25–36.
- [29] Zhang, M. and Peng, H. 2010. An Empirical Study of Influence Factors in Customer Loyalty for Department Store Service. *4th International Conference on Management and Service Science (MASS)*. Wuhan, China, August 24–26.
- [30] Ibrahim, M. F. and Wee, C. N. 2002. Determinants of Entertaining Shopping Experiences and Their Link to Consumer Behaviour: Case Studies of Shopping Centres in Singapore. *J. Retail. Leisure Property*, 2(4): 338–357.
- [31] Machirori, T. and Fatoki, O. 2011. An Empirical Investigation into the Extent of Customer Satisfaction and Customer Loyalty at Big Retail Stores in King William's Town. *South African Journal of Business Management*. 5(17): 7665–7673.
- [32] Brink, A. and Berndt, A. 2004. *Customer Relationship Management and Consumer Service*.
- [33] Hollensen, F. 2003. *Marketing Management-A Relationship Approach*. London: Pearson Education Limited.
- [34] East, R., Harris, P., Wilson, G. and Hammond, K. 1995. Correlates of First-Brand Loyalty. *Journal of Marketing Management*. 11(5): 487–497.
- [35] Machirori, T. and Fatoki, O. 2011. An Empirical Investigation into the Extent of Customer Satisfaction and Customer Loyalty at Big Retail Stores in King William's Town, South Africa. *African Journal of Business Management*. 5(17): 7665–7673.
- [36] Wirtz, J. and Chew, P. 2002. The Effects of Incentives, Deal Proneness, Satisfaction and Tie Strengthen on Word-of-Mouth Behavior. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*. 2(13): 141–162.
- [37] Kendrick, A. 1998. Promotional Products Versus price Promotion in Fostering Customer Loyalty: A Report of Two Controlled Field Experiments. *Journal of Services Marketing*. 4(12): 312–326.
- [38] Churchill, G. A. and Surprenant, C. 1982. An Investigation into the Determinants of Customer Satisfaction. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 19(4): 491–504.
- [39] Gowda, S. M. 2011. Impact of Shopping Experience in Retaining Customer Loyalty-A Case Study of Shoppers Stop http://www.indianmba.com/Faculty_Column/FC1326/FC1326a/fc1326a.html. Accessed on May 2013.